

Minutes

Mossmorran & Braefoot Bay Community & Safety Committee Meeting

Date: 13 March 2014

Time: 18:30

Location: Council Chamber, City Chambers, Dunfermline

Present: Peter Lockhart, Chair – Fife Councillor
Rachael Turner, Secretary
Susan Leslie – Fife Councillor
Alex Macdonald – Burntisland cc
Robert Arnott – Crossgates cc
Colin McPhail – Dalgety Bay & Hillend cc
James Glen – Lochgelly cc
Ron McKenzie – Auchtertool cc
Ian Hackers – ExxonMobil Chemical Limited
David Burgess – Shell
John Raine – Shell
Gavin Yates – Fife Councillor
Stuart Anderson – SEPA

Absent: Amelia Howie – Lumphinnans cc
Alex Haddow – Cowdenbeath cc

1. Apologies for Absence

- Amelia Howie – Lumphinnans Community Council
- Alex Haddow – Cowdenbeath Community Council
- Susan Leslie leaving early – Fife Councillor

2. Declaration of Interest

- None

3. Minutes of Previous Meeting

- In the future email Rachael (minute taker) privately with requested changes to the minutes.

5. Wind Farm Developments in Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Area

Issues raised:

- Planning application in process for more wind turbines, to be discussed when planning application is in place.
- JG stated there have been additional wind turbine applications in place from West Coast Energy towards Mossmorran, as well as applications from Airvolution Energy to improve their wind turbines. – These issues were felt irrelevant, as they do not affect Mossmorran.

- JG requested to see a report, at the next meeting, to show that the wind turbines won't be in danger of fire, due to gas leaks – SL replied if there is a safety issue, the oil companies or SEPA will raise this to the committee.
- The wind turbines are on the community council's area, all of which were approved two years previously; therefore the applications are approved no matter the discussion at this meeting.
- SL highlighted that the planning applications for the wind turbines would be discussed at the 'West Planning Committee,' which is governed by legislation, therefore does not immediately involve the community councillors.
- ILH stated that ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd are notified regarding planning applications around the Mossmorran site, these are thoroughly reviewed to identify any issues that could affect Mossmorran e.g.
 - The quarrying operations to take place at the Quarry between Mossmorran and Crossgates was investigated regarding any chances of vibrations from blasting which could affect the running from Mossmorran to Grangemouth/Braefoot Bay pipelines.
 - When Kennedy Renewables applied for planning permission for the 9 wind turbines, we reviewed the application to ensure there were no safety issues, such as blades flying off, ice throw, etc. No issues were identified at the planned locations.
- When the planning application for more wind turbines was requested, one of the biggest issues was the potential danger of ice throw. Analysis of current relations, mathematics and engineering took place to identify the possibility of ice throw relating to the direction of the wind.
- Only issues regarding new planning applications will be discussed at this meeting – all members agreed.

6. Current Situation Reports

6.1 Shell UK LTD – Circulated Report

- Issues raised:
- Safety – no recordable Injury Cases over the last quarter. One Process Safety event resulting in two notifications to SEPA in the last quarter, including:
 - 10/01/14 a furnace incident resulting in flaring above PPC consent volume (20 tons) within 24hours and a small propane leak from hot oil exchanger. Intermittent instrumental failure initiated process upset on Module 2 Furnace. Recovery from the process upset initiated automatic flaring due to pressure increases in getting product to specification. Down to the intermittent nature of the problem and the

- recoveries repeated, the volume of flaring exceeded the limit of 20 tons within 24 hours. (Volume flared 24ton)
- Due to cycling of temperatures for recoveries, hot oil/propane exchanger developed a small propane weep of 1.1 KG, for that reason the module was shut down. The exchanger has been fixed.
 - Both of these incidents were reported to SEPA under the PPC permit requirements.
 - RM requested further explanation regarding the weep from the heat exchanger – DB replied, when the heating cycles go through strains, the end of the exchanger head was examined to measure the torques on each of the bolts of the exchanger and found that four torques were out, resulting in the weeps. Washers have been used to retain the torque.
- Environmental – SEPA notifications as per process safety events. Compliance Assessment Scheme Final Assessment from SEPA for FNGL for 2013, Mossmorran was 'Good.' Ground flare B returned to service after refurbishment, both ground flares are now operational. (Mentioned in the previous meeting) Braefoot Bay VRU new relief valves ordered due to arrive 17/03/14. Unit planned to return to service week beginning 17/03/14.
 - Emergency Planning Exercises – monthly COMAH case exercises continue organised by Petrofac simulated, blue light services (excluding ambulance service) carried out monthly with Fife council present. COMAH exercises to be continued monthly instead of annually.
 - Mossmorran Activities – Module 1 returned to service in mid January following a three and a half month turnaround to perform rejuvenation work, such as replacing pipe work and instrumentation. Completion of this allows all three modules operational. High product throughputs in Jan/Feb.
 - Community Feedback – three complaints, including noise from Braefoot Bay Terminal received numerous times from the same resident – there were no significant or unusual noise was detected. Received an email from a resident in Lochgelly regarding the flaring in January – Shell UK Ltd responded to this. Letter received from a resident in Dalgety Bay in relation to the Fife coastal path from east Dalgety Bay – letter sent to land agent to investigate the issue. However if a surface were put in place, Shell UK Ltd would be liable for those injured on the surface – further investigation is being carried out to resolve the issue.
 - CM mentioned that the charity, Fife Coastal and Countryside Trust, maintain the Fife coastal path, Shell UK Ltd provided a copy of the complaint letter for the charity.
 - Visits – two HSE inspections, another due end of March.

- External Affairs – GeoBus continues to visit High Schools. 16 students from Lochgelly High School to be interviewed for work experience during the Easter break. Shell Springboard regional final was held on 04/03/14 at the Edinburgh Carbon Centre, five finalists across the UK, three were awarded a split of £110,000 (donated by Shell UK Ltd).
- Donations – total since last report £12,457.00

6.2 ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd – Circulated report

Issues Raised:

- Safety, Health and Environment – 6,774 days (more than 18 years) without a time losing injury, 300 days since last recordable injury, 1,632 days without an environmental incident and 213 days since last flaring incident.
- Site visits – in March FEP hosted a visit for 30 final year Mechanical and Electrical Engineering Students from Edinburgh University. Investigating the possibility to organise site visits to the Mossmorran site for residents in the local area in August/September 2014 – more details will be provided at the next meeting in June.
- Corporate Hospitality – FEP Burns Supper on 24/01/14 at Balbirnie House Hotel, Hosted guests at the 6 Nations Rugby International – Scotland v England on 08/02/14.

Plant Operations:

- SEPA Compliance Assessment Scheme results have been finalised:
 - ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd – Braefoot Bay: Excellent
 - ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd – Mossmorran: Good
- SEPA carried out a COMAH Inspection of the Braefoot Bay Facility – no major issues identified, awaiting final report being presented to advise any minor follow-up actions.
- HSE carried out two independent, two day inspection visits on-site inspecting:
 1. Operations of cooling tower – maintenance schedule, chemistry of the water and structure. No major issues identified and awaiting final report being presented to advise of any minor follow-up actions.
 2. Safety Systems to review if the HSE guidelines are being followed e.g. instrumentation and electrical systems. No major issues identified and awaiting final report being presented to advise of any minor follow-up actions.
- In January a tabletop intruder response exercise was held for the Mossmorran site.
- On 20/04/14 and 18/05/14 routine emergency exercises will be held with Scottish Fire and Rescue Service at the Marine Terminal at Braefoot Bay, with blue light services in attendance.

- Community Complaint – one complaint received, during the reporting period, from an Auchtertool resident regarding black smoke from the plant – no flaring was occurring at the time of the complaint. The suspected black smoke was steam with the surrounding lights making it appear as black smoke.
- Contributions – small contributions during the reporting period of £24,450, as well as £4,670 in Safety Incentive Scheme. Q1 2014 Employees Volunteering and School Governor grants – reported in the next meeting in June.

Other:

- Burns Lunches for local senior citizens took place as follows Aberdour on 28/01/14, Dalgety Bay on 29/01/14 and Crossgates on 30/01/14.
- ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd at FEP donated £10,000 to Safe Drive Stay Alive Road show, November 2014.
- Sponsorship package of £5,000 for summer work placement students at Ecology Centre – will assist in summer Environmental Pond Dipping event.
- ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd Education Trust have advertised for young people to join training scheme who will join August/September, including:
 - 2 instrument trainees
 - 1 inspection trainee
 - 1 mechanical trainee
 - 2 process trainees
 - 2 administration trainees
- Team of young volunteers from The Ecology Centre cleaned the FEP Environmental pond – exercise went well with a large volume of pondweed removed. The young volunteers thoroughly enjoyed their day onsite. In thanks for their hard work ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd are making a donation of £2,000 to support the community youth programme, run by the Ecology Centre.
- ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd has donated £2,500 to the charity, Music in Hospitals, providing children with musical performances – was successful.
- Recruiting five from seven current trainees to join permanent workforce.
- Community surveys underway by Ipsos MORI – results in future meetings.
- Letters sent to ExxonMobil link schools to apply for grants – all schools have replied with their requests.

Questions:

- LCC requests the list of questions present on the community surveys by ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd and Shell UK Ltd (Section 6.2 – Other)
 - SL stated it would be more beneficial if the surveys were sent out after they're completed. The questions would be included, as well as the results, allowing one to understand the questions in relation to the answers.
 - Blank copy of survey questions not to be sent – all members agreed.

- RM questioned the ‘young peoples’ comment in the ExxonMobil Education Trust advertisements for trainees – ILH responded that we will adjust the advertisement for future years; anyone can apply, regardless of their age. (Section 6.2 – Other)
- AM questioned if the Mossmorran site visits in August/September were specific to ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd or if it could be a joint event with Shell UK Ltd – ILH stated if Shell UK Ltd would like to take part the two companies would work together to organise a joint visit. (Section 6.2 – Site Visits)

6.3 SEPA – Circulated report

Issues Raised:

- Mossmorran web-page on SEPA website – web-page finalised and awaiting SEPA management approval. PL feels the minutes of this committee should appear on the web-page also. SA to email all committee members when the web-page is operating.
- Little Raith ambient air monitoring, benzene report – The annual mean concentrations of benzene, at all three sites, are consistently well below the Scottish air quality objectives, and the EU limit value of 1.54 ppb. Wind turbines do not appear to have a detrimental impact on the concentrations of benzene in Lochgelly and Cowdenbeath.
- Complaints – received one relating to noise during the flaring on 10/01/14, which had been addressed with Shell UK Ltd.
- Site inspections 2014/15
 - Shell Fife NGL Plant: 4 PPC + 2 COMAH
 - Shell Braefoot Bay: 1 COMAH
 - ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd FEP: 4 PPC + 2 COMAH
 - ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd Braefoot Bay: 1 PPC/IPC + 1 COMAH
- Inspector changes 2014 – Stuart Anderson now carries out Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay PPC and COMAH regulatory regimes.
- ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd
 - Incidents – none.
 - PPC inspection – additional inspections for proposed test work to the Braefoot Bay firewater system – followed up at scheduled site inspection, 20/03/14.
 - PPC Compliance Assessment Scheme – Braefoot Bay - excellent. Mossmorran - good.
 - COMAH inspection – Braefoot Bay scheduled inspection with SEPA officer on bunding of C5+ storage tank – no issues noted.
 - Emergency Exercises – none.

- Shell UK Ltd
 - Incidents – furnace incident resulting in flaring above PPC consent volume, 10/01/14 (see 6.1 Shell UK LTD Circulated Report – Safety)
 - PPC Inspections – none
 - PPC Compliance Assessment Scheme Rating – 2013 results, Fife NGL Plant - good.
 - COMAH inspections – none.
 - Emergency Exercises – none.

Questions:

- PL suggested including the Little Raith wind farm report to this committee and if so, a representative from Kennedy Renewables should be present. JG supports this motion. ILH suggested that the Air Quality Review Group should discuss the Little Raith wind farm report and then provide feedback to this committee.
- JG questioned the annual mean concentrations of the peak of 3 ppb and have SEPA identified what caused the 3 ppb peak – SA stated there is no obvious reason for this. PL stated the Air Quality Review Group would discuss these issues in their June meeting. Thus allowing this committee to discuss the issues further in the following September meeting.
- ILH suggested a thank you letter should be sent to Sarah Mieztis for her contribution in this committee – PL agreed and would send one on behalf of the committee.
- RM questioned a minor inconsistency with the explanation of the Shell UK Ltd incident 10/01/14, in the Shell UK Ltd Report the incident refers to heat exchangers and the SEPA report refers to furnaces – DB explained: The Shell UK Ltd report showed the furnace had tripped, the first problem caused the temperature drop, this caused the heat cycle, which caused the propane weep in the exchanger.
- JG questioned the noise complaint during flaring 10/01/14 and what actions have been taken, SA and DB stated the flaring was short-term, 4-5 hours; the module was shutdown despite the noise complaint.

6.4 Fife Council

No report

6.5 Community Council

- Burntisland cc
 - Thank you to ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd for the Burns Supper and rugby game invite.
 - The ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd community matters newsletter was distributed amongst the community.
 - Pleased with the support and contributions, from the companies, to the Safe Drive Stay Alive campaign, the ecology centre and RNLI charity.

- Burntisland Primary School is not on ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd link schools programme.
- The head teacher of Burntisland Primary School is interested in the idea of introducing science workshops to the school, which was discussed in the December meeting.
- Dalgety Bay & Hillend cc
 - Thank you for the Dalgety Bay invitations for Burns Lunch and to the Burns Supper.
 - Discussed in the previous meeting, the community council arranged a public meeting to discuss the development of land in east Dalgety Bay, owned by Shell UK Ltd and Esso Petroleum Company. 170 people attended and agreed, no development should take place in the future – decision was put through to Fife plan consultation.
 - JR to send CM an electronic copy of a plan showing the land around Braefoot Bay before marine terminal was built – so Dalgety Bay Particles Advisory Group are aware of what land Shell UK Ltd own.
- Crossgates cc
 - Thank you for the pantomime tickets and rugby game invite.
 - Crossgates Primary School has now completed their paperwork for the ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd's Education grant.
- Auchtertool cc
 - Thank you for the pantomime tickets.
- Lochgelly cc
 - Seeking for time based air quality monitors – ILH stated that time based air quality monitoring was very expensive and would not be provided for Lochgelly. The wind data analysis confirmed that the wind only blows from Mossmorran to Lochgelly around 3.5% of the time and any investment could not be justified on this basis. Regardless, LCC feel there is pollution in the local area; therefore air quality monitoring should take place as a precaution.
 - > DB stated the data shows there is no need for air quality monitoring, if it were to show different results, one would analyse this and open a business case to fund the request over long term, this would be difficult to undertake when the data shows there are no issues. PL agrees permanent air quality monitoring should take place in Lochgelly to reassure the community.
 - > RA stated the implementation of air quality monitors in Lochgelly would cause adjacent communities to question the absence of air quality monitors in their community. Short-term air quality monitoring is expensive and has previously shown no issues – permanent time based air quality monitoring is more expensive.
 - > SL stated the wind directs most pollution towards north Kirkcaldy past Auchtertool – discussion of air quality monitoring in Auchtertool

- but no desire in Kirkcaldy, where most of pollution would travel.
- > AM stated in the past there was a proposal to stand down the Air Quality Monitoring Group following community monitoring carried out in 2000 and 2008, which showed no issues. It was felt that the community should have reassurance of the air quality – occasional monitoring carried out to reach midpoint between funding and the committee aspirations. ILH stated the Air Quality Group produce a yearly report distributed to relevant Fife Council committee's – the reports produced to date have not shown any pollution issues that would cause concern.
 - > Only SEPA can insist on the implementation of the air quality monitors – currently they are not insisting due to previous test results not indicating any issues. This issue is formally noted.
 - Lochgelly have not yet been provided with a hazard risk assessment to identify the risks to Lochgelly from the three modules at the Shell NGL Plant, Mossmorran. The former risk assessment took place when there were only two modules. The issues raised in Lochgelly include the potential risk of, in the worst-case scenario, Lochgelly being critically damaged.
 - > DB stated emergency regulators, SEPA and COMAH inspections are in place to assess the impact on local areas – this information is documented. LCC have requested from SEPA the documentation regarding emergency scenarios, but were denied due to censoring, which cannot be removed. The request made to SEPA was analysed to identify what information can be released, this depends on the level of national security of the site. The St Fergus gas plant is level 5 – no information can be released. Mossmorran is level 4 – minimal information can be released. LCC have the permitted information from SEPA, but no more can be provided – LCC can contact the information commissioner or planning authorities for more information.
 - Dr Jackie Hyland presented an air quality report to the Scottish Government, this highlighted that communities near a source of PM10 and NO2 emissions, can impact on mortality rates. LCC question, have ExxonMobil Chemical Ltd and Shell UK Ltd, undertook research of PM10 and NO2 emissions to identify if it will increase mortality rates in adjacent communities to Mossmorran.
 - PM10 monitoring is carried out twice yearly on the FEP boilers. Particles are not formed if gas is used in fuel. They are formed when oil or a solid fuel is used. FEP does use a mixture of oil and gas on the boilers for fuel. The flue gas stacks are monitored twice yearly for PM10 and no issues have been identified. All FEP's stacks are monitored on a 3 monthly basis for NOX and again no issues have been identified. Both PM10 and NOX monitoring are included in FEP's permits from SEPA.
 - > NHS has produced a report regarding increases in mortality due to emissions and has shown no issues within the local area. LCC would like a report regarding the affect of lung capacity in Lochgelly

relating to the emissions from Mossmorran. This would be difficult as other environmental factors in Lochgelly can affect lung capacity e.g. PL stated there are high rates of smoking in Lochgelly, ILH stated, vehicle emissions from the adjacent bypass, A92, could also be a contributing factor.

- > CM stated NHS Fife have carried out numerous studies and surveys regarding public health in Fife – can be found on NHS Fife website. The companies cannot undertake these studies and surveys and only NHS Fife can. LCC to contact Edward Coyle – Director of Public Health for his opinion and more detailed information.
- Thank you for the Pantomime tickets.

7. AOB

None

8. Date of future meetings:

12 June 2014

11 September 2014

11 December 2014